

Jointly Held
Finance/Personnel and Planning Committees
Meeting Minutes

April 17, 2018

Members Present: Sharon Hairston, Jointly Held Committee Chair, Board Vice President
Adrienne Heard, Board President
Vince Corrado
Franz Hoge
Belinda Matthews Stenson
Thomas Weckesser
David P. Williamson, Chair, Investment Advisory

Excused Absence: Sharon Howard, Chair, Planning Committee
John Lumpkin, Chair, Finance/Personnel Committee

Staff in Attendance: Mark Donaghy
Julie Beard
Roland Caldwell
Joyce Carter
Chris Cole
Amy Blankenship, Coolidge Wall
Skip Dunkle
Tim Harrington
John Hoff
Jessica Olson
Brandon Policicchio
Bob Ruzinsky
Mary K. Stanforth
Robert Thomas

Others Attending: Dr. Richard Henry, League of Women Voters

Call to Order

Ms. Sharon Hairston called the meeting to order at 9:15 a.m. A quorum was present and proper notice of the meeting had been given.

Approval of March 21, 2018 Meeting Minutes

Ms. Hairston asked if attendees desired a reading of the minutes or if there were any corrections to the minutes? Hearing no requests or corrections, Ms. Hairston declared APPROVAL of the March 21, 2018 meeting minutes.

Greater Dayton Regional Transit Authority

May 2018 Board Action Items:

Action Item #2 – As Needed Electrical Services for RTA Facilities and Properties

Mr. Ruzinsky stated the purpose of this procurement is for RTA to contract with qualified contractors for as needed electrical services for RTA facilities and properties. This project is consistent with RTA’s core values of Safety, Stewardship, and Quality Service as we demonstrate our commitment to maintain our facilities in a state of good repair and make our customers a priority.

The successful contractors will provide electrical services for RTA facilities and properties, will support upcoming projects, and provide emergency services wherever needed. The award can be made to multiple contractors to ensure adequate as need services.

Sealed bids for As Needed Electrical Services for RTA Facilities and Properties were solicited though the Dayton Daily News, Dayton Weekly News, and Transit Talent. Invitations for Bid were sent to forty-five (45) firms.

On March 13, 2018, three (3) bids were received and publicly opened. The bid result is as follows:

Year One						
		Calvin Electric Arcanum, OH		Kastle Electric Dayton, OH		York Electric Dayton, OH
Item	Description	Hourly Rate		Hourly Rate		Hourly Rate
1	Journeyman	\$58.53		\$60.00		\$70.00
2	Apprentice	\$37.18		\$42.00		\$50.00
3	Supervisor	\$63.25		\$66.00		\$75.00
4	Other			* \$62.00		
Year Two						
Item	Description	Hourly Rate		Hourly Rate		Hourly Rate
1	Journeyman	\$59.70		\$62.00		\$72.00
2	Apprentice	\$37.92		\$44.00		\$52.00
3	Supervisor	\$64.52		\$68.00		\$77.00
4	Other			* \$64.00		
Year Three						
Item	Description	Hourly Rate		Hourly Rate		Hourly Rate
1	Journeyman	\$60.89		\$64.00		\$74.50
2	Apprentice	\$38.68		\$46.00		\$55.00
3	Supervisor	\$65.81		\$70.00		\$80.00
4	Other			* \$66.00		
Option Year One						
Item	Description	Hourly Rate		Hourly Rate		Hourly Rate
1	Journeyman	\$62.11		\$66.00		\$78.00
2	Apprentice	\$39.46		\$48.00		\$60.00
3	Supervisor	\$67.13		\$72.00		\$85.00
4	Other			*\$68.00		

Option Year Two					
Item	Description	Hourly Rate		Hourly Rate	Hourly Rate
1	Journeyman	\$63.35		\$68.00	\$81.00
2	Apprentice	\$40.25		\$50.00	\$65.00
3	Supervisor	\$68.48		\$74.00	\$90.00
4	Other			*\$70.00	
				*In case a laborer is needed for digging or painting.	

Orders were placed under small purchases last year in the amount of \$85,000.

Mr. Corrado asked if there could be challenges with Calvin Electric given that they would be traveling from Darke County. Mr. Ruzinsky stated this is not a problem and RTA has received great and responsive service from Calvin Electric through previous work conducted. Mr. Corrado also asked if RTA will receive detailed invoices regarding all work completed. Mr. Ruzinsky stated yes and that the project manager overseeing the work will review those upon receipt.

Mr. Hoge asked if RTA bid this procurement using prevailing wage and if RTA requested the “other description” items submitted by the bidders. Mr. Ruzinsky confirmed that RTA did bid out via prevailing wage and that the “other description” items were not requested but often companies will submit additional work that they can offer within the same contract.

MOTION made by Mr. Corrado and SECONDED by Mr. Hoge that the Finance/Personnel and Planning Committees RECOMMEND to the Board of Trustees a contract AWARD to Calvin Electric and Kastle Electric, for three years of As Needed Electrical Services for a project total of up to \$750,000 and for two option years for a project total of up to \$500,000 for a grand total of \$1,250,000 for as needed electrical services over the five-year period. Work can be assigned to the individual firms based on availability, specialization, and job price. Annual blanket purchase orders will be maintained with each firm for routine jobs and other work will be handled with additions to the blankets or through standard purchase orders. Total spending will not exceed \$750,000 for the base period and \$500,000 for the option period, but may be less based on actual need. In addition, the Committees recommend the above award, as well as the ratification of \$85,000 spent under small purchasing procedures, for a grand total of \$1,335,000. This procurement will be funded 80% through Federal grant funds.

The motion was APPROVED by voice vote 7-0.

Action Item #3 – Genfare Software Support Agreement

Mr. Harrington stated that until two years ago, Genfare provided ongoing support of their fare boxes and associated server systems at no charge. They would help troubleshoot issues, assist with limited repairs, and help change fare sets on fare boxes, Ticket Vending Machines (TVMs) and Printing and Encoding Machines (PEMs).

Genfare now charges an annual fee for their support. The fee covers minor version data system upgrades and patches, and grants priority issue resolution. Additional benefits under the agreement include:

- 5% discount off of OEM spare parts, repairs, software upgrades, system support services outside the scope of this agreement, and some types of training
- One (1) system-wide fare structure update per year
- One (1) Data System database rebuild per year

RTA has made do without the support agreement for the past two years, however without it, RTA had to pay approximately \$5,000 for the fare systems upgrade and new pass encoding, and Maintenance and MIS are now getting little cooperation from Genfare in solving issues with the fare boxes. The 5% discount on parts would also be of benefit. This procurement is being brought to the Board at this time because it supports RTA's core value of good Stewardship.

This agreement is sole source due to the fact that the only company that offers support for this software is Genfare, the original developer of the software. ORC 306.43 (h) (3) exempts from competitive bidding maintenance of software supplied by the original vendor. The cost for the maintenance is as follows:

BASE YEAR

Description	Price
Annual Support Agreement (software for 182 fare boxes)	\$35,000
Annual Support Agreement (software for 6 TVMs, 2 PEMs)	4,500
TOTAL	\$39,500

OPTION YEAR

Description	Price
Annual Support Agreement (software for 182 fare boxes)	\$36,050
Annual Support Agreement (software for 6 TVMs, 2 PEMs)	4,635
TOTAL	\$40,685

Since this is a sole source procurement, an analysis was conducted to determine if the pricing received was fair and reasonable. Based on what other transit agencies with a similar amount of equipment are paying, the prices quoted were determined fair and reasonable.

Mr. Weckesser stated that the contract price was reasonable given that over the past two years RTA did not pay for a support agreement but still received support. In addition, he stated that it is estimated the support will save RTA \$7,000 to \$8,000 a year on parts.

Mr. Donaghy also emphasized that the current fare system makes up one-third of RTA's annual road calls.

Mr. Williamson asked about RTA's progress in updating current fare technology and moving towards a cashless system. Mr. Policicchio stated RTA staff recently released a Request for Information to hear from vendors who could deliver this type of system and that RTA's goal is to replace the current system and be cashless by the year 2020. This lead to a discussion about the

future of funding and fares which was led by Mr. Hoge as he referenced his previous suggestion of reviewing the feasibility of a free fare system.

MOTION made by Mr. Hoge and SECONDED by Mr. Weckesser that the Finance/Personnel and Planning Committees RECOMMEND to the Board of Trustees a contract AWARD to Genfare, a Division of SPX Corporation, in the total amount of \$39,500 for a one-year software maintenance agreement, plus \$40,685 for one option year for a grand total award amount not to exceed \$80,185. The Genfare software maintenance agreement will be funded with 100% operating funds.

The motion was APPROVED by voice vote 7-0.

Action Item #4 – Retiree Death Benefit Plan Actuarial Study

Ms. Stanforth stated Board Trustees established a Life Insurance Trust in 1986 for the purpose of setting aside funds to pay death benefits to the estates of former employees retired from the RTA. The current RTA Policy was included in the Board Committee packet.

As part of the annual year-end audit, Madison Consulting Group has concluded the following range of liability for the Greater Dayton RTA as of December 31, 2017 to fund \$2,152,500 in death benefits for 382 retirees:

- Low Estimate of Discounted Benefits \$ 873,747
- Central Estimate of Discounted Benefits \$1,027,938
- High Estimate of Discounted Benefits \$1,182,129

Madison Consulting Group recommends funding the Benefit Plan at the Central Estimate of \$1,027,938. A discount rate of 5% was assumed in making the calculations.

At December 31, 2017, the net market value of the Life Insurance Trust was \$900,060, indicating that a deposit of \$127,878 is required to fund the December 31, 2017 Life Insurance Trust obligation.

Mr. Hoge questioned whether this Plan should be fully funded at \$2.15 million. Ms. Stanforth stated that her understanding is that the Plan is annually funded at the central estimate. However, Ms. Stanforth will address this question with the State Auditor's Office and report back to the Committees. Mr. Williamson asked if the Board can discontinue this plan in the future. Ms. Stanforth will also research this question and report back to the Committees in the near future.

MOTION made by Ms. Heard and SECONDED by Ms. Matthews Stenson that the Finance/Personnel and Planning Committees RECOMMEND to the Board of Trustees INCREASING the Life Insurance Trust by \$127,878 to fund the December 31, 2017 Life Insurance Trust obligation.

The motion was APPROVED by voice vote 7-0.

Action Item #5 – Transit Fare Adjustments – Paratransit Monthly Pass

Mr. Policicchio explained that in order to improve accessibility and expand payment options for Connect - Paratransit customers, the RTA will introduce a monthly pass to the existing fare payment structure. This action item supports RTA's core value of Quality Service.

The monthly pass will cost \$115 per month and is eligible for use in the calendar month the pass is identified for. Customers will be able to purchase the monthly pass from select RTA Transit Centers or by calling the RTA Finance Department to purchase via phone. Travel under the monthly pass is available for both complementary ADA and countywide services.

<u>Connect - Paratransit</u>	<u>Current</u>	<u>Proposed</u>
Monthly Pass	N/A	\$115.00

MOTION made by Ms. Matthews Stenson and SECONDED by Mr. Williamson that the Finance/Personnel and Planning Committees RECOMMEND to the Board of Trustees the ADOPTION of the Connect – Paratransit Monthly Pass and ATTACHMENT A, Greater Dayton Regional Transit Authority Fare Structure, to be effective Sunday, June 3, 2018 at 3:01 AM. Furthermore, that the Chief Executive Officer will be authorized to do all things necessary to implement the new fare structure.

The motion was APPROVED by voice vote 7-0.

Informational and Discussion Items:

Customer and Business Development Update

Mr. Policicchio previously included in today’s meeting packet a summary document of recent activities in the Customer and Business Development Department. There were no questions from Committees members regarding this report.

Transit Network Redesign Presentation

Mr. Hoff provided a detailed presentation on the upcoming Transit Network Redesign project. The presentation was provided within the Board Committee meeting packet.

KPI Data Review

KPI data was previously included in today’s meeting packet. There were no questions from Committees members regarding this report.

January 2018 Sales Tax Update

Sales tax information was not received and available for today’s meeting. The information will be emailed as soon as it’s available.

March 2018 Financial Statements

Ms. Stanforth reported that RTA’s March 2018 Net Income after Local Depreciation is \$345,216 compared to Budgeted Income of \$310,804. March 2018 Year-to-Date Net Loss after Local Depreciation is \$330,626 compared to a Year-to-Date Budgeted Loss of \$671,507. The details associated with the financial statements are included in the Committee Package. After three (3) months of Operations, RTA realized a \$340,881 positive variance as compared to budget.

Small Purchasing Information

Ms. Stanforth stated Small Purchasing Information was previously included in today’s meeting packet. There were no questions from Committees members regarding this report.

Next Meeting Dates

A Jointly held Finance/Personnel and Planning Committees meeting will be held on May 15 and June 19, 2018. Meetings will start promptly at 8:30 a.m.

Executive Session

A request was made by Ms. Hairston to RECESS into Executive Session at 11:01 a.m. and roll call was taken. All seven (7) Committees Members agreed to RECESS for the purpose of discussing a Legal Matter.

The Finance/Personnel and Planning Committee meeting re-opened at 11:11 a.m. with no further action. All seven (7) Committees Members agreed to RECONVENE to regular session.

Adjournment

MOTION made by Ms. Matthews Stenson and SECONDED by Ms. Heard to ADJOURN the meeting. The motion was APPROVED by voice vote 7-0. The meeting adjourned at 11:12 a.m.

Attest



Sharon Hairston, Chair



Brandon Policicchio, Committee Secretary